



B 20953

# GNOMON

KRITISCHE ZEITSCHRIFT  
FÜR DIE GESAMTE  
KLASSISCHE ALTERTUMSWISSENSCHAFT

HERAUSGEGEBEN VON

MARTIN BENTZ · RUTH BIELFELDT  
PETER EICH · HANS-JOACHIM GEHRKE  
CHRISTOPH HORN · JOSEPH MARAN  
GERNOT MICHAEL MÜLLER · OLIVER SCHELSKE  
KATHARINA VOLK · PAUL ZANKER

SCHRIFTFLEITUNG

GERNOT MICHAEL MÜLLER (VERANTWORTLICH) UND  
ADRIAN WEISS



96. BAND

**Sonderdruck**

HEFT 5

VERLAG C.H.BECK MÜNCHEN

and insightful commentary is her strong exposition of chapter I.3 (pp. 277–282) on the usefulness of logic (*fī manfa‘at al-manṭiq*), which provides: (I) the historical and intellectual context of the ideas treated in the chapter (among other things Meno’s Paradox as well as the Stoic distinction of an internal and an external speech – λόγος ἐνδιάθετος and λόγος προφορικός – the former of which Avicenna knew via Philoponus and the latter of which he attained from Galen and/or al-Fārābī), (II) an explanation of what these ideas amount to, (III) hints towards potential conflicts with other works of Avicenna as well as their possible relation to matters of chronology, (IV) parallel passages in Avicenna’s other works, and (V) suggestions for potential sources of Avicenna. This is all extraordinarily rich and clearly expands upon the already helpful references contained in the apparatus.

It would take a much longer time than a reviewer has at their disposal to sift through all the details and unearth the shortcomings – but above all also appreciate the merits – of Di Vincenzo’s work, in particular the riches of her commentary. The book – introduction, edition, translation, and commentary – is a pioneering achievement, exemplarily and expertly, putting the community of scholars in a well-prepared position for studying the precis of Avicenna’s views on the predicables. In other words, the work can begin now – on the shoulders of Di Vincenzo’s formidable publication.

Nijmegen

*Andreas Lammer*

\*

**Maud Devolder, Iliaria Caloi** (éds.): *Le Bâtiment Dessenne et les abords Sud-Ouest du palais dans l’établissement pré- et protopalatial de Malia*. Athen: École Française d’Athènes 2019. 447 S. (Études crétoises. 37).

The Bronze Age site of Malia is exceptional because it has not been overbuilt in modern times and gives a good idea of what a MM II settlement with harbour looked like. The monograph under review is a welcome town to the ‘Études Crétoises’ series of the French School of Archaeology in Athens and publishes the excavations of the so-called ‘Magasins Dessenne’, named after the French archaeologist who excavated this complex in the 1960s, and one of ‘grands ensembles’ of the MM II town. The volume is organized in two parts, the first treating the architecture and finds from the 1960s excavations and the second the results of the 2012–2015 cleaning operation, which included some strategic soundings. One of the main strengths of this publication, besides finally publishing the MM II structure, lies in its contribution to our knowledge of Prepalatial, in particular EM IIA-B and EM III, Malia.

The architectural study consists of detailed descriptions of the walls and rooms but also the digitization of the architectural remains with photogrammetric and 3D laser scanning techniques (Gianluca Cantoro, Athos Agapiou, Sylviane Dédérax and Apostolos Sarris). The architectural descriptions are clear and adequately

illustrated by drawings, plans, photos and reconstructions, but it is somewhat unfortunate that the two new stone by stone state plans (1 and 2) at the back of the volume are not fold-outs – as is usually the case<sup>1</sup> – and that as a consequence some room and wall numbers disappear into the folds of the book binding. The main result of the architectural study is the hypothesis that the ‘Magasins Dessenne’ is a single building – and not two separate houses.<sup>2</sup> This building, renamed the ‘Bâtiment Dessenne’, consists of 3 building phases, all dated within the century that is covered by the MM II ceramic period. The initial building is identified as consisting of two wings to the east (rooms 3–6, 17–18) and west (19–29) of a long narrow room (room 2) to which in a second phase rooms 1, 7–8, and in a third phase rooms 10–16 were added. Although the evidence for architectural additions in the 2nd and 3rd phase is convincing and supported by structural links between walls, I am less convinced by the proposal that rooms 2–6 and 17–29 all belong to the first building phase, and this for the following reasons. First, there are no walls connecting the eastern and western part and therefore no structural wall connections to confirm that rooms 2–6, 17–18 and rooms 19–29 were indeed conceived as a single entity and thus contemporary. Second, there is a qualitative difference between the east and west wings; the west wing had stone paved floors rather than beaten earth floors, an upper floor with stone slabs and several balconies, and is architecturally speaking of a higher quality. Third, the balcony proposed to have protruded over the eastern part of room 2 at the level of the upper floor (based on the three stone column bases on the ground floor along its eastern side), would have looked out onto the west wall of room 2. This is an odd location for a balcony and combined with the fact that the east and west walls of room 2 are not parallel, I am inclined towards identifying the eastern, architecturally superior wing as the initial building, to which the west part (rooms 17–29) was added. This balcony would make more sense if (initially) intended to look out towards people approaching from the west, proceeding from the harbour to the town.

It is interesting to see that just like in Quartier Mu,<sup>3</sup> the initial core-building was substantially enlarged and that the rooms that were added in the 2nd and 3rd phase were in the first place aimed at storage (rooms 7, 8, 10, 13). They were fitted with low sandstone platforms that were covered in plaster and at the basis of which runs a channel to capture liquids spilled in vases collecteurs – a typical Maliote architectural feature in MM II. The 2014 clearing operation exhumed the storage vases left in situ by Dessenne and petrographical analysis demonstrates that they were produced by the same workshops that also provided Quartier Mu and the Crypte Hypostyle. This workshop would have been located in Chersonissos (Nodarou,

<sup>1</sup> Martin Schmid, René Treuil (eds.): *Architecture minoenne à Malia. Les bâtiments principaux du Quartier Mu (A, B, D, E) (Minoen Moyen II)*. Paris 2007. (Études Crétoises. 36.).

<sup>2</sup> René Treuil: *Les «maisons Dessenne» à Malia*. In: Philipp P. Betancourt, Vassos Karageorghis, Robert Laffineur, Wolf-Dietrich Niemeier (eds.): *Meletemata. Studies in Aegean Archaeology Presented to Malcolm H. Wiener as He Enters his 65<sup>th</sup> Year*. Liège/Texas 1999, S. 841–845.

<sup>3</sup> Martin Schmid: *Travaux de restauration et d'aménagement*. In: *Bulletin de Correspondance Hellénique* 127, 2003, pp. 470–479; Martin Schmid: *Le palais de Malia et la Crypte hypostyle. nouvelles données architecturales*. Proceedings of the 8<sup>th</sup> International Cretological Congress. Heraklion 2006, pp. 53–67; Martin Schmid, René Treuil: *Architecture minoenne à Malia. Les bâtiments principaux du Quartier Mu*. Paris 2017.

p. 151), which is also the place of provenance for the white (p. 39) limestone used for stone floor slabs. Two of the *pitthoi* were impressed by seals that were probably produced by the contemporary Malia Workshop Subgroup, and the same applies to the fluorite conoid seal and the serpentinite *petschaft* found by Dessenne.<sup>4</sup> Two lumps of clay from room 8 show imprints of having been used to seal vases or a door, but had not been stamped by any seal (p. 120–121), which draws attention to the insufficiently studied practice of sealing without seals.<sup>5</sup> One of the signs of the Cretan Hieroglyphic script, la ‘main gantée’, is attested on another vase and was probably incised before firing. Amongst the other finds from the MM II building may be also noted a few stone tools (M. P. Montagné) and (fragments of) 16 stone vases (Thérèse Claeys). Although the quality and range of stone vases is said to be comparable to Quartier Mu, unlike the latter, there is no evidence that production was taking place in the ‘Bâtiment Dessenne’.

The second part of the monograph deals with the material from the soundings in rooms 20, 19, 2, 15 and from the area to the east of the ‘Bâtiment Dessenne’, which confirmed suspected MM IIA construction date. Underneath the MM IIB destruction level, prepalatial (EM IIA, EM IIB and EM III) levels were reached. Besides remains of houses, a paved road (p. 262) was located. A major fill on top of the latter is interpreted as marking the end of EM II occupation in this part of the site (p. 264) and the start of the levelling the open space, which corresponds to the later West court (p. 262). This fill corresponds to that encountered during the 1988–1989 soundings to the south of the Crypte Hypostyle (p. 271–275).<sup>6</sup> Because of two possible EM III fragments (p. 238–240, 250) amongst what is predominantly EM IIB pottery, the construction of the court is dated to EM III (p. 262–264). The main author is of the opinion that the Palace was constructed in MM I (p. 21, 264, 343), which seems at odds with the proposed construction date of the court fronting it (at the latest EM III), the monumentality of the EM IIB architecture and the high quality of the material from the latter (p. 342), and of the architectural remains underneath the West and North Wings of the later Palace.<sup>7</sup> In addition of these EM IIB rooms, the walls have the same orientation as the MM I–II Palace walls, which differs from the EM IIA walls in this location, and traces of an EM IIB plastered court were found below the MM I central court. Regardless of whether these EM IIB walls were planned as an integrated building, or were the result of modifications of and additions within EM IIB to an initial core building, they without any doubt constituted a monumental EM IIB structure with two courts, one to the west and a second one court underneath the later central court.

---

<sup>4</sup> Maria Anastasiadou: *The Middle Minoan Three-Sided Soft Stone Prism. A Study of Style and Iconography*. Heidelberg 2018. (*Corpus der minoischen und mykenischen Siegel*. 9.1.), pp. 58–63.

<sup>5</sup> Erik Hallager: *Sealing without seals. An explanation*. (<https://www.scribd.com/document/437722118/Sealing-Without-Seals-Vip>).

<sup>6</sup> Martin Schmid: *Travaux de restauration et d’aménagement*. In: *Bulletin de Correspondance Hellénique* 127, 2003, pp. 470–479; Martin Schmid: *Le palais de Malia et la Crypte hypostyle. nouvelles données architecturales*. *Proceedings of the 8<sup>th</sup> International Cretological Congress*. Heraklion 2006, pp. 53–67; Martin Schmid, René Treuil (eds.): *Architecture minoenne à Malia. Les bâtiments principaux du Quartier Mu*. Paris 2017.

<sup>7</sup> Olivier Pelon: *La salle à piliers du palais de Malia et ses antécédents. Recherches complémentaires*. In: *Bulletin de Correspondance Hellénique* 117, 1993, pp. 523–546.

This situation compares well with EM IIB structures around the (EM IIB) central court at Knossos, which were the result of continuous modification and additions.<sup>8</sup>

How does the MM II ‘Bâtiment Dessenne’ fit into the MM II town? Back in 2002, I suggested that these ‘grands ensembles’ reflect a heterarchical and competitive landscape in which different groups, which were associated with these buildings, were actively pursuing the accumulation of agricultural and other wealth, were involved in the production and/or acquisition of elite goods, and also hosting rituals involving the consumption of food and drink.<sup>9</sup> Since 2002, ongoing research and excavations have shed additional light on the MM II ‘grands ensembles’. Quartier Mu has now been completely published,<sup>10</sup> making it the best published MM II complex on Crete. A cleaning operation in the ‘Sanctuaire aux cornes’ clarified that the latter is not a freestanding shrine but part of a larger MM II two-storied building that extends to the north-east and south-east and had an upper story.<sup>11</sup> An architectural study of the Crypte Hypostyle greatly clarified its architectural plan, which was conceived in function of 5 subterranean rooms with internal ashlar walls and a polythyron.<sup>12</sup> Between the Crypte Hypostyle and Maison Δα, a new sector (Sector Pi) was excavated, with traces of a Protopalatial complex which seems functionally similar to Quartier Mu (storage, production and consumption) and to its west another substantial and well-constructed buildings Δγ and Δβ, and confirm that the street (‘Rue de la Mer’) leading from Quartier Mu to the Palace was bordered by large.<sup>13</sup> These newly excavated structures are welcome additions to the already known buildings.<sup>14</sup> Electromagnetic prospection reveals dense occupation in this part of town, but also around the ‘Sanctuaire aux cornes’

---

<sup>8</sup> Peter Tomkins: *Inspecting the Foundations. The Early Minoan Project in Review*. In: Maria Relaki, Yiannis Papadatos (eds.): *From the Foundations to the Legacy of Minoan Archaeology*. Oxford 2018, pp. 36–67.

<sup>9</sup> Ilse Schoep: *Social and Political Organization in the Proto-palatial period. The Case of Middle Minoan II Malia*. In: *JMA* 15, 1, 2002, pp. 101–132.

<sup>10</sup> Jean-Claude Poursat, Carl Knappett (eds.): *Le Quartier Mu IV. La poterie du Minoen Moyen II. Production et utilization*, Paris 2005; Martin Schmid, René Treuil (eds.): *Architecture minoenne à Malia. Les bâtiments principaux du Quartier Mu (A, B, D, E) (Minoan Moyen II)*. Paris 2017. (Études Crétoises. 36.).

<sup>11</sup> Isabelle Bradfer-Burdet, Martin Schmid (eds.): *Sanctuaire aux Cornes. Sondages dans le cadre d’un projet de couverture du monument*. In: *Bulletin de Correspondance Hellénique* 128–129. 2004–2005, p. 971, fig. 37.

<sup>12</sup> Martin Schmid: *Travaux de restauration et d’aménagement*. In: *Bulletin de Correspondance Hellénique* 127, 2003, pp. 470–479.

<sup>13</sup> <http://www.arscan.fr/grec-protolitho-egee/recherches-sur-le-terrain-2/malia-recherches-dans-le-secteur-pi/>; Sylvie Müller-Celka, Christophe Benech, Lionel Darras, Elise Fovet, Laurent Lespez, Côme Parfant, Lola Perruchon-Monge, Niki Papa-konstantinou, Maia Pomadère, Emmanuelle Régagnon, Franck Vautier: *Recherches complémentaires sur l’organisation de la ville minoenne de Malia*. In: *Bulletin archéologique des Écoles françaises à l’étranger, Grèce*, published 29 september 2021, accessed on 3 July 2023, under: <http://journals.openedition.org/baefe/4270>.

<sup>14</sup> Isabelle Bradfer-Burdet, Maia Pomadère: *Two Houses or One Large Complex? In: Kevin Glowacki, Natalia Vogeikoff-Brogan (eds.): ΣΤΕΓΑ. The Archaeology of Houses and Households in Ancient Crete*. Princeton 2011, S. 99–109.

and close to the harbour.<sup>15</sup> It has also shown that the town does not extend far to the east of the Palace and that it was clearly oriented towards the west, where the harbour is located. From the harbour, the Palace would have been visible, as it was constructed on top of a limestone plateau that had already been levelled in EM IIB. Several roads led from the harbour to the centre: the ‘Rue de la Mer’ led to the North part of the Palace via Quartier Mu and the Crypte Hypostyle and a second road ran along the north wall of the ‘Sanctuaire MM II’ to arrive at the West Court of the Palace via the ‘Bâtiment Dessenne’. Just like the Crypte Hypostyle to the north, the ‘Bâtiment Dessenne’ was the last stop on the way to the Palace and the location of these buildings was probably not fortuitous. The monograph under review confirms that on account of its size, the quality of its architecture with its innovative architectural features, and its location at near the south-west angle of the MM II Palace, the ‘Bâtiment Dessenne’ is one of the MM II ‘grands ensembles’ in Malia. What its precise function was, is hard to say because the building was only partially excavated, but what has been excavated points in the first place towards the storage, preparation and consumption of foodstuffs and liquids. Like in the Crypte Hypostyle, evidence for production seems to be lacking, which suggests functional differences between the MM II grands ensembles. A potential small (10,92 grams) hematite weight (p. 275) could have been used to weigh precious material (metals or spices), but whether this is enough to suggest the involvement of the inhabitants of the Building Dessenne in long distance trade (p. 347) is debatable.

Leuven

*Ilse Schoep*

\*

---

<sup>15</sup> Sylvie Müller Celka et al: Recherches complémentaires sur l’organisation de la ville minoenne de Malia. In: Bulletin archéologique des Écoles françaises à l’étranger, Grèce, published 29 september 2021, accessed on 3 July 2023, under: <http://journals.openedition.org/baefc/4270>.